

City of Dunbar West Virginia Policemen's Pension and Relief Fund

GASB 68 Actuarial Information for the Measurement Period Ending June 30, 2022

Bolton

Submitted by:

James Ritchie, ASA, EA, FCA, MAAA President of Bolton Retirement 443.573.3924 jritchie@boltonusa.com Jordan McClane, FSA, EA, FCA, MAAA Consulting Actuary 667.218.6935 jmcclane@boltonusa.com



November 29, 2022

Ms. Connie Fulknier City Clerk City of Dunbar 210 12th St. / P.O. Box 483 Dunbar, WV 25064 Captain Matthew Arthur Pension Board Secretary City of Dunbar Policemen's Pension and Relief Fund

Re: City of Dunbar Policemen's Pension and Relief Fund GASB 68 Actuarial Information for the Measurement Period Ending June 30, 2022

Dear Connie,

The following report contains the GASB 67 and GASB 68 actuarial information for the City of Dunbar Policemen's Pension and Relief Fund to be included in the City's financial statements for FY 2022. The GASB 67 information has been provided as of June 30, 2022 (the GASB 68 measurement date for FY 2022).

Methodology, Reliance and Certification

This report is prepared for the City. The report contains the actuarial information to be included with the City's financial statements for the year ending June 30, 2022 (the City's fiscal year end date) as required by GASB 68. This information has been prepared for use in the financial statements of the City. This information is not intended for, nor should it be used for, any additional purposes.

The total pension liability is based on the July 1, 2021 actuarial valuation rolled forward to June 30, 2022. The methods, assumptions, and participant data used are detailed in the July 1, 2021 actuarial valuation report with the exception of the actuarial cost method. These calculations are based on the Entry Age Normal cost method as required by GASB 67. The calculation of the Actuarially Determined Contribution for the fiscal year ending June 30, 2022 is contained in the July 1, 2020 actuarial valuation report. The discount rate assumption may have changed if a blended rate was used for GASB purposes.

The included calculations assume that the members and the City will continue to make all required contributions in accordance with the City's funding policy.

The long-term nominal expected rate of return on pension plan investments was determined using a methodology approved by the Municipal Pensions Oversight Board (MPOB) and is based on the funded status (current and projected), equity exposure, and funding policy.

These calculations and comparisons with assets are applicable for the valuation date only. The future is uncertain, and the plan may become better funded or more poorly funded in the future. This valuation does not provide any guarantee that the plan will be able to provide the promised benefits in the future.

Ms. Connie Fulknier November 29, 2022 Page 2

Methodology, Reliance and Certification (cont.)

This is a deterministic valuation in that it is based on a single set of assumptions. This set of assumptions is one possible basis for our calculations. Other assumptions may be equally valid. The future is uncertain and the plan's actual experience will differ from the assumptions; the differences may be significant or material because the results are very sensitive to the assumptions made and, in some cases, to the interaction between the assumptions. We may consider that some factors are not material to the valuation of the plan and may not provide a specific assumption for those factors. We may have used other assumptions in the past. We will likely consider changes in assumptions at a future date.

The City is responsible for selecting the plan's funding policy based on four methods allowed for under state law. The actuarial valuation methods are chosen by the actuary in accordance with actuarial standards of practice promulgated by the Actuarial Standards Board of the American Academy of Actuaries and as required by GASB 67 & 68. The MPOB selects the asset valuation methods and assumptions; these selections are reviewed by a qualified actuary no less than every five years. The actuarial process. The policies, methods and assumptions used in this valuation are those that have been so prescribed and are described in this report. The City and MPOB are solely responsible for communicating to Bolton Partners, Inc. any changes required thereto.

The City could reasonably ask how the valuation would change if we used a different assumption set or if plan experience exhibited variations from our assumptions. This report does not contain such an analysis. That type of analysis would be a separate assignment.

The cost of this plan is determined by the benefits promised by the plan, the plan's participant population, the investment experience of the plan and many other factors. An actuarial valuation is a budgeting tool for the City or, in this case, a measure of accounting expense. It does not affect the cost of the plan. As the experience of the plan evolves, it is normal for the level of contributions and expense of the plan to change.

We make every effort to ensure that our calculations are accurately performed. We reserve the right to correct any potential errors by amending the results of this report or by including the corrections in a future valuation report.

Because modeling all aspects of a situation is not possible or practical, we may use summary information, estimates, or simplifications of calculations to facilitate the modeling of future events in an efficient and cost-effective manner. We may also exclude factors or data that are immaterial in our judgment. Use of such simplifying techniques does not, in our judgment, affect the reasonableness of valuation results for the plan.

This report is based on plan provisions, census data, and asset data submitted by the City. We have relied on this information for purposes of preparing this report, but have not performed an audit. The accuracy of the results presented in this report is dependent upon the accuracy and completeness of the underlying information. The plan sponsor is solely responsible for the validity and completeness of this information.

The valuation was completed using both proprietary and third-party models (including software and tools). We have tested these models to ensure they are used for their intended purposes, within their known limitations, and without any known material inconsistencies unless otherwise stated.



Ms. Connie Fulknier November 29, 2022 Page 3

Methodology, Reliance and Certification (cont.)

The City is solely responsible for selecting the plan's investment policies, asset allocations and individual investments. Bolton Partners, Inc.'s actuaries have not provided any investment advice to the City.

The information in this report was prepared for the internal use of the City, the plan and their auditors in connection with our actuarial valuations of the pension plan as required by GASB 68. This report may not be used for any other purpose; Bolton Partners, Inc. is not responsible for the consequences of any unauthorized use or the reliance on this information by any other party.

The calculation of actuarial liabilities for valuation purposes is based on a current estimate of future benefit payments. The calculation includes a computation of the "present value" of those estimated future benefit payments using an assumed discount rate; the higher the discount rate assumption, the lower the estimated liability will be. For purposes of estimating the liabilities (future and accrued) in this report, an assumption based on the expected long-term rate of return on plan investments is used. If the plan is expected to become insolvent, the return assumption is blended with a long-term municipal bond rate. Using a lower discount rate assumption, such as a rate solely based on long-term bond yields, could substantially increase the estimated present value of future and accrued liabilities.

This report provides certain financial calculations for use by the auditor. These values have been computed in accordance with our understanding of generally accepted actuarial principles and practices and fairly reflect the actuarial position of the Plan. The various actuarial assumptions and methods which have been used are, in our opinion, appropriate for the purposes of this report.

The report is conditioned on the assumption of an ongoing plan and is not meant to present the actuarial position of the plan in the case of plan termination. Future actuarial measurements may differ significantly from the current measurements presented in this report due to such factors as the following: plan experience differing from that anticipated by the economic or demographic assumptions, changes in economic or demographic assumptions, increases or decreases expected as part of the natural operation of the methodology used for these measurements (such as the end of an amortization period or additional cost or contribution requirements based on the plan's funded status), and changes in plan provisions or applicable law.

The undersigned enrolled actuaries meet the Qualification Standards of the American Academy of Actuaries to render the actuarial opinion contained herein. The July 1, 2021 actuarial valuation report contains information that is integral to the results contained herein and a copy may be provided upon request.

Sincerely,

Jans Rateline

James Ritchie, ASA, EA, FCA, MAAA

ful Mide

Jordan McClane, FSA, EA, FCA, MAAA





Net Pension Liability of the Employer

The components of the net pension liability of the Employer at June 30, 2022, were as follows:

Total pension liability		\$ 8,459,388
Plan fiduciary net position		(6,211,826)
Employer's net pension liability	_	\$ 2,247,562
Plan fiduciary net position as a percentage of the total pension liability		73.43%

Actuarial assumptions. The total pension liability was determined by an actuarial valuation as of July 1, 2021 rolled forward to June 30, 2022 using the following actuarial assumptions, applied to all periods included in the measurement:

Inflation	2.50 percent
Salary increases	Rates vary by years of service
Single discount rate (BOY)	6.00%
Single discount rate (EOY)	6.00%
Investment rate of return (BOY)	6.00%, net of pension plan investment expense, including inflation
Investment rate of return (EOY)	6.00%, net of pension plan investment expense, including inflation
Long-term municpal bond rate (BOY)	1.92%
Long-term municpal bond rate (EOY)	3.69%
Mortality	SOA PubS-2010(B) with generational projection using Scale MP-2019
Year Fund is projected to be fully funded	2029
Year assets are expected to be depleted	N/A
for a closed plan	

The above is a summary of key actuarial assumptions. Full descriptions of the actuarial assumptions are available in the July 1, 2021 actuarial valuation report.

Sensitivity of the net pension liability to changes in the discount rate

	1%	6 Decrease 5.00%	Dis	Current scount Rate 6.00%	19	% Increase 7.00%
Employer's net pension liability	\$	3,359,005	\$	2,247,562	\$	1,337,350



Changes in the Net Pension Liability

			ase (Decrease	
	То	tal Pension Liability (a)	an Fiduciary et Position (b)	et Pension Liability (a) - (b)
Balances at 6/30/21	\$	8,392,980	\$ 7,413,735	\$ 979,245
Changes for the year:				
Service cost		90,573		90,573
Interest		489,908		489,908
Changes of benefit terms		-		-
Differences between expected and actual experience		(58,387)		(58,387)
Changes of assumptions		-		-
Contributions - employer (including Premium Tax Allocation)			244,164	(244,164)
Contributions - member			28,571	(28,571)
Net investment income			(828,098)	828,098
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions		(455,686)	(455,686)	-
Administrative expense			(190,860)	190,860
Other			 -	 -
Net Changes		66,408	 (1,201,909)	 1,268,317
Balances at 6/30/22	\$	8,459,388	\$ 6,211,826	\$ 2,247,562
Return on Investments			(11.5%)	



Components of Employer's Pension Expense for the Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2022

Note	Description	Amount
А	Service cost	\$ 90,573
В	Interest on the total pension liability	489,908
А	Changes of benefit terms	-
С	Differences between expected and actual experience	(41,258)
С	Changes of assumptions	(281,288)
А	Employee contributions	(28,571)
D	Projected earnings on pension plan investments	(433,609)
С	Differences between expected and actual earnings on	110,977
	plan investments	
А	Pension plan administrative expense	190,860
А	Other changes in fiduciary net position	-
	Total Pension Expense	\$ 97,592

Notes:

- A Provided in the Changes in Net Pension Liability exhibit.
- B Based on the following calculation:

		Amount for Period (a)	Portion of Period (b)	Interest Rate (c)	E	rojected arnings x (b) x (c)
Beginning total pension liability	\$	8,392,980	100%	6.00%	\$	503,579
Service cost (End of Year)		90,573	0%	6.00%		-
Benefit payments, including refunds of employee contributions		(455,686)	50%	6.00%		(13,671)
Total interest on the total pension liability					\$	489,908

C Provided in the Schedules of Deferrals.

D Based on the following calculation:

	A	Mount for Period (a)	Portion of Period (b)	Projected Rate of Return (c)	E	rojected arnings x (b) x (c)
Beginning plan fiduciary net position	\$	7,413,735	100%	6.00%	\$	444,824
Employer contributions		244,164	50%	6.00%		7,325
Employee contributions		28,571	50%	6.00%		857
Benefit payments, including refunds of employee contributions		(455,686)	50%	6.00%		(13,671)
Administrative expense and other		(190,860)	50%	6.00%		(5,726)
Total Projected Earnings					\$	433,609



Deferred Outflows of Resources and Deferred Inflows of Resources Related to Pensions

At June 30, 2022, the Employer reported deferred outflows of resources and deferred inflows of resources related to pensions from the following sources:

	red Outflows Resources	erred Inflows Resources
Differences between expected and actual experience	\$ -	\$ 29,193
Changes of assumptions	-	-
Net difference between projected and actual earnings	608,882	
on pension plan investments		-
Total	\$ 608,882	\$ 29,193

Amounts reported as deferred outflows of resources and deferred inflows of resources related to pensions will be recognized in pension expense as follows:

Year ended June 30:	
2023	\$ 70,892
2024	122,905
2025	133,549
2026	252,343
2027	-
Thereafter	-

Changes in the Employer's Net Pension Liability and Related Ratios Last 10 Fiscal Years

Total pension liability	2022	2021	2020	2019	2018	2017	2016	2015	2014	2013
Service cost	\$ 90,573	\$ 130,732	\$ 136,553	\$ 164,702	\$ 163,266	\$ 204,003	\$ 155,496	\$ 154,153	\$ 158,129	\$ -
Interest	489,908	519,769	501,797	485,653	475,282	458,949	448,843	435,033	424,294	
Changes of benefit terms	-	-	-	-	-		-	-	-	-
Differences between expected and actual experience	(58,387)	(125,341)	125,154	35,549	11,381	(295,491)	(42,815)	(15,818)	-	-
Changes of assumptions	-	(562,577)	-	-	-	-	764,273	-	-	-
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(455,686)	(464,853)	(463,066)	(370,610)	(397,529)	(365,969)	(341,024)	(328,131)	(312,559)	-
Net change in total pension liability	66,408	(502,270)	300,438	315,294	252,400	1,492	984,773	245,237	269,864	-
Total pension liability - beginning	8,392,980	8,895,250	8,594,812	8,279,518	8,027,118	8,025,626	7,040,853	6,795,616	6,525,752	-
Total pension liability - ending (a)	\$ 8,459,388	\$ 8,392,980	\$ 8,895,250	\$ 8,594,812	\$ 8,279,518	\$ 8,027,118	\$ 8,025,626	\$ 7,040,853	\$ 6,795,616	\$ -

Plan fiduciary net position	2022	2021	2020	2019	2018	2017	2016	2015	2014	2013
Contributions - employer (including Premium Tax Allocation)	\$ 244,164	\$ 266,240	\$ 279,136	\$ 237,840	\$ 367,933	\$ 311,103	\$ 267,563	\$ 336,682	\$ 247,987	\$
Contributions - member	28,571	25,799	24,377	29,640	30,974	38,064	41,579	41,487	41,773	
Net investment income	(828,098)	985,813	431,146	473,328	292,093	412,260	24,629	74,608	504,712	
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(455,686)	(464,853)	(463,066)	(370,610)	(397,529)	(365,969)	(341,024)	(328,131)	(312,559)	
Administrative expense	(190,860)	(33,417)	(31,482)	(29,992)	(29,731)	(30,024)	(29,851)	(33,687)	(36,937)	
Other	 -	 -	 -	 (9)	 -	 373	 -	 169	 -	
Net change in plan fiduciary net position	\$ (1,201,909)	\$ 779,582	\$ 240,111	\$ 340,197	\$ 263,740	\$ 365,807	\$ (37,104)	\$ 91,128	\$ 444,976	\$
Plan fiduciary net position - beginning	7,413,735	6,634,153	6,394,042	6,053,845	5,790,106	5,424,299	5,461,403	5,370,275	4,925,299	
Plan fiduciary net position - ending (b)	\$ 6,211,826	\$ 7,413,735	\$ 6,634,153	\$ 6,394,042	\$ 6,053,845	\$ 5,790,106	\$ 5,424,299	\$ 5,461,403	\$ 5,370,275	\$
Employer's net pension liability - ending (a)-(b)	\$ 2,247,562	\$ 979,245	\$ 2,261,097	\$ 2,200,770	\$ 2,225,673	\$ 2,237,012	\$ 2,601,327	\$ 1,579,450	\$ 1,425,341	\$
Plan fiduciary net position as a percentage of the total pension liability	73.43%	88.33%	74.58%	74.39%	73.12%	72.13%	67.59%	77.57%	79.03%	N/
Covered payroll	\$ 299,474	\$ 337,697	\$ 356,236	\$ 437,624	\$ 427,525	\$ 535,150	\$ 543,069	\$ 522,352	\$ 540,997	N/A
Employer's net pension liability as a percentage of covered payroll	750.50%	289.98%	634.72%	502.89%	520.59%	418.02%	479.00%	302.37%	263.47%	N/
Expected average remaining service years of all participants	2.00	2.00	3.00	4.00	3.67	4.88	5.07	5.07	N/A	N/A

Notes to Schedule:

Benefit changes: There were no changes for FY2022.

Changes of assumptions: There were no changes for FY2022.

Schedule of Employer Contributions Last 10 Fiscal Years

	2022	2021	2020	2019	2018	2017	2016	2015	2014	2013
Actuarially determined contribution	\$ 209,467	\$ 273,790	\$ 289,385	\$ 290,874	\$ 259,161	\$ 289,083	\$ 274,669	\$ 188,222	\$ 198,495	\$ 195,880
Contributions in relation to the actuarially determined contribution										
Employer provided	101,442	123,670	138,401	152,413	183,970	167,225	121,105	124,274	127,598	135,000
State provided	142,722	142,570	140,735	85,427	183,963	143,878	146,458	212,408	120,389	128,182
Contribution deficiency (excess)	\$ (34,697)	\$ 7,550	\$ 10,249	\$ 53,034	\$ (108,772)	\$ (22,020)	\$ 7,106	\$ (148,460)	\$ (49,492)	\$ (67,302)
Covered payroll	\$ 299,474	\$ 337,697	\$ 356,236	\$ 437,624	\$ 427,525	\$ 535,150	\$ 543,069	\$ 522,352	\$ 540,997	\$ 565,602
Contributions as a percentage of covered employee payroll	81.53%	78.84%	78.36%	54.35%	86.06%	58.13%	49.27%	64.46%	45.84%	46.53%

Notes to Schedule

Valuation date:

Actuarial determined contribution amounts are calculated as of the beginning of the fiscal year (July 1) for the year immediately following the fiscal year. The assumption shown below are those used in the 7/1/2020 actuarial valuation to calculate the FY2022 ADC. Assumptions used to determine all contributions in the past would not have been the same.

Methods and assumptions used to determine	e contribution rates:
Actuarial cost method	Entry Age Normal
Amortization method	Level Dollar
Remaining amortization period	15 to 28.5 years
Asset valuation method	4-year smoothed market
Inflation	2.50 percent
Salary increases	Rates vary by years of service
Investment rate of return	6.00%, net of pension plan investment expense, including inflation
Retirement age	Rates vary by age
Mortality	SOA PubS-2010(B) with generational projection using Scale MP-2019

Schedule of Differences between Projected and Actual Earnings on Pension Plan Investments

In conformity with paragraph 33b of Statement 68, the effects of differences between projected and actual earnings on pension plan investments are recognized in pension expense using a systematic and rational method over a closed five-year period, beginning in the current reporting period. The following table illustrates the application of this requirement.

Year	betv and on	Differences ween Projected Actual Earnings Pension Plan Investments	Recognition Period (Years)	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2	023	2024	2025	2026
2018	\$	54,463	5	\$ 10,893	10,893	10,893	10,893	10,891					
2019		(114,091)	5		\$ (22,818)	(22,818)	(22,818)	(22,818)		(22,819)			
2020		(53,234)	5			\$ (10,647)	(10,647)	(10,647)		(10,647)	(10,646)		
2021		(593,952)	5				\$ (118,790)	(118,790)		(118,790)	(118,790)	(118,792)	
2022		1,261,707	5					\$ 252,341		252,341	252,341	252,341	252,34
Vet increa	se (de	crease) in pension	expense					\$ 110,977	\$	100,085	\$ 122,905	\$ 133,549	\$ 252,34

Deferred Outflows of Resources and Deferred Inflows of Resources Arising from Differences between Projected and Actual Earnings on Pension Plan Investments

					Balan June 3		
Year	tment Earnings than Projected (a)	Investment Earnings Greater Than Projected (b)	Amounts Recognized in Pension Expense Through June 30, 2022 (c)	С	Deferred Dutflows of Resources (a) - (c)	[Deferred nflows of tesources (b) - (c)
2018	\$ 54,463	\$ -	\$ 54,463	\$	-	\$	-
2019	-	114,091	91,272		-		22,819
2020	-	53,234	31,941		-		21,293
2021	-	593,952	237,580		-		356,372
2022	1,261,707	-	252,341		1,009,366		-
				\$	1,009,366	\$	400,484

Schedule of Differences between Expected and Actual Experience

In conformity with paragraph 33a of Statement 68, the effects of differences between expected and actual experience are recognized in pension expense, beginning in the current reporting period, using a systematic and rational method over a closed period equal to the average of the remaining service lives of all employees that are provided with pensions through the pension plan (active and inactive employees), determined as of the beginning of the measurement period. The following table illustrates the application of this requirement.

							Increa	se (Decrease) in Pen	nsion Expens	se Aris	ing from t	he Rec	cognition	of Differ	rences b	etween E	Expected	and Ad	tual Expe	rience								
Year	Differences between Expected and Actual Experience	Recognition Period (Years)	Prior	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017		2018	21	019	2	020	202	21	20	22	2	023	20:	24	202	25	202	6	2027	т	nereafter
Prior	-																							-		-		-	-
2013	-	-																											
2014																													
2015	(15,818)	5.074685				\$ (3,117)	(3,117)	(3,11	7)	(3,117)		(3,117)		(233)															
2016	(42,815)	5.065546					\$ (8,452)	(8,45	2)	(8,452)		(8,452)		(8,452)		(555)													
2017	(295,491)	4.882084						\$ (60,52	6)	(60,526)	((60,526)	((60,526)	(53	3,387)													
2018	11,381	3.674669							\$	3,097		3,097		3,097		2,090													
2019	35,549	4.000000									\$	8,887		8,887	;	8,887		8,888											
2020	125,154	3.000000											\$	41,718	4	1,718		41,718											
2021	(125,341)	2.000000													\$ (63	62,671)		62,670)											
2022	(58,387)	2.000000															\$ (2	29,194)		(29,193)									
Net increase	se (decrease) in per	sion expense															\$ (41,258)	\$	(29,193)	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-	\$	- \$	-

Deferred Outflows of Resources and Deferred Inflows of Resources Arising from Differences between Expected and Actual Experience

Year	Experience Losses (a)	perience Gains (b)	Amounts Recognized i Pension Expense Throu June 30, 2022 (C)	gh (Balar June 3 Deferred Outflows of Resources (a) - (c)	:0, 20: D In Re	
Prior	\$-	\$ -	\$	- \$	-	\$	-
2013		-		-	-		-
2014		-		-	-		-
2015		15,818	15,8	818	-		-
2016	-	42,815	42,8	815	-		-
2017	-	295,491	295,4	191	-		-
2018	11,381	-	11,3	881	-		-
2019	35,549	-	35,5	549	-		-
2020	125,154	-	125,1	54	-		-
2021	-	125,341	125,3	341	-		-
2022		58,387	29,1	94	-		29,193
				\$	-	\$	29,193

In conformity with paragraph 33a of Statement 68, the effects of changes of assumptions should be recognized in pension expense, beginning in the current reporting period, using a systematic and rational method over a closed period equal to the average of the remaining service lives of all employees that are provided with pensions through the pension plan (active and inactive employees), determined as of the beginning of the measurement period. The following table illustrates the application of this requirement.

								Increa	se (Decrease) ii	Pension Expen	se Arising fron	n the Effects of Ch	anges of Assum	otions					
	Changes of	Recognition Period																	
Year	Assumptions	(Years)	Prior	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024	2025	2026	2027	Thereafter
Prior	ş -	-																	-
2013	-	-																	
2014	-	-																	
2015	-	5.074685																	
2016	764,273	5.065546					\$ 150,877	150,877	150,877	150,877	150,877	9,888							
2017	-	4.882084																	
2018	-	3.674669																	
2019	-	4.000000																	
2020	-	3.000000																	
2021	(562,577)	2.000000										\$ (281,289)	(281,288)						
2022	-	2.000000																	
Net increase	e (decrease) in per	sion expense											\$ (281,288)	\$-	\$-	\$ -	\$-	\$-	\$-

9

Deferred Outflows of Resources and Deferred Inflows of Resources Arising from Changes of Assumptions

					ices at 60, 2022
Year	Increases in the Total Pension Liability (a)	Decreases in the Total Pension Liability (b)	Amounts Recognized in Pension Expense Through June 30, 2022 (c)	Deferred Outflows of Resources (a) - (c)	Deferred Inflows of Resources (b) - (c)
Prior	ş -	\$-	\$-	\$ -	\$-
2013	-	-	-	-	-
2014	-	-	-	-	-
2015	-	-	-	-	-
2016	764,273	-	764,273	-	-
2017	-	-	-	-	-
2018	-	-	-	-	-
2019	-	-	-	-	
2020	-	-	-	-	-
2021	-	562,577	562,577	-	-
2022		-	-	-	-
				s -	s